Top 50 Florida Homeowner Insurers' Consumer Complaint Statistics Calendar Year 2009

Of the insurers who write a significant amount of homeowner business in Florida, which ones have more than their share of complaints and which have fewer? The attached table ranks the 50 insurers (out of 169 total) who wrote the most homeowner insurance in Florida in 2010. Together the 50 companies wrote over 91% of the Florida homeowner premiums. They are ranked by their 2010 "Complaint Index." A Complaint Index of more than 1.00 means that the company's complaint share was higher than its market share, which is negative. A Complaint Index of less than 1.00 means that the company had a lower complaint share than its market share, which is positive.

		Complaint	Company	Number of	Complaint	Market
#	Company Name	Index	Code	Complaints	Share	Share
1	Peoples Trust Ins Co	5.44	13125	23	2.73%	0.50%
2	Florida Peninsula Ins Co	2.35	10132	47	5.57%	2.37%
3	Hartford Ins Co Of The Midwest	2.10	37478	16	1.90%	0.90%
4	Southern Oak Ins Co	1.82	12247	12	1.42%	0.78%
5	Universal Prop & Cas Ins	1.71	10861	115	13.63%	7.97%
6	Federated National Ilns Co	1.60	27980	14	1.66%	1.03%
7	Capitol Preferred Ins Co	1.52	10908	6	0.71%	0.47%
8	Nationwide Ins Co Of FL	1.52	10948	15	1.78%	1.17%
9	Cypress Prop & Cas Ins Co	1.23	10953	8	0.95%	0.77%
10	American Traditions Ins Co	1.21	12359	6	0.71%	0.59%
11	Southern Fidelity Ins Co Inc	1.07	10136	9	1.07%	1.00%
12	Olympus Ins Co	1.06	12954	10	1.19%	1.11%
13	United Prop & Cas Ins Co	1.06	10969	16	1.90%	1.79%
14	ASI Assur Corp	1.04	12196	9	1.07%	1.03%
15	Citizens Prop Ins Corp	1.02	10064	132	15.64%	15.28%
16	First Community Ins Co	0.99	13990	4	0.47%	0.48%
17	Sunshine State Ins Co	0.99	10860	9	1.07%	1.08%
18	Tower Hill Signature Ins Co	0.91	12538	15	1.78%	1.95%
19	Homeowners Choice Prop & Cas Ins Co	0.85	12944	11	1.30%	1.53%
20	American Strategic Ins Corp	0.82	10872	6	0.71%	0.87%
21	St Johns Ins Co Inc	0.80	11844	22	2.61%	3.28%
22	Castle Key Ins Co	0.73	30511	11	1.30%	1.79%
23	Security First Ins Co	0.71	10117	10	1.19%	1.68%
24	Universal Ins Co of NA	0.68	11986	8	0.95%	1.39%
25	Tower Hill Prime Ins Co	0.53	11027	7	0.83%	1.57%
26	Tower Hill Select Ins Co	0.51	12011	5	0.59%	1.16%
27	Amica Mut Ins Co	0.49	19976	2	0.24%	0.48%
28	First Liberty Ins Corp	0.46	33588	2	0.24%	0.52%
29	Omega Ins Co	0.45	38644	2	0.24%	0.52%
30	Gulfstream Prop & Cas Ins Co	0.44	12237	3	0.36%	0.82%
31	Florida Farm Bur Gen Ins Co	0.43	21817	2	0.24%	0.56%
32	Tower Hill Preferred Ins Co	0.40	29050	5	0.59%	1.48%
33	Geovera Specialty Ins Co	0.38	10182	2	0.24%	0.63%
34	Foremost Ins Co Grand Rapids MI	0.36	11185	2	0.24%	0.65%
35	USAA Cas Ins Co	0.35	25968	5	0.59%	1.69%
36	Homewise Ins Co	0.35	12438	5	0.59%	1.70%

37	Liberty Mut Fire Ins Co	0.29	23035	4	0.47%	1.63%
38	State Farm FL Ins Co	0.28	10739	31	3.67%	12.96%
39	Florida Family Ins Co	0.26	10688	2	0.24%	0.92%
40	Lexington Ins Co	0.24	19437	1	0.12%	0.50%
41	First Protective Ins Co	0.20	10897	2	0.24%	1.17%
42	Castle Key Ind Co	0.19	10835	2	0.24%	1.27%
43	Fidelity Fire & Cas Co	0.17	10186	1	0.12%	0.72%
44	ASI Preferred Ins Corp	0.13	13142	1	0.12%	0.95%
45	Florida Farm Bureau Cas Ins Co	0.12	31216	1	0.12%	0.96%
46	United Serv Automobile Assn	0.08	25941	2	0.24%	2.92%
47	American Home Assur Co	0.07	19380	1	0.12%	1.82%
48	Federal Ins Co	0.06	20281	1	0.12%	1.83%
49	Ark Royal Ins Co	0.00	13038	0	0.00%	0.53%
50	Firemans Fund Ins Co	0.00	21873	0	0.00%	0.49%
	Totals			625	74.07%	91.24%

This information was drawn from the Florida Office of Insurance Regulation's (OIR) 2011 Annual Report, published in February 2011. A full copy of the report can be accessed at http://www.floir.com/siteDocuments/2011AnnualReport.pdf. The material referenced here can be found on pages 120 and following.

Further definitions and notations provided by the OIR for their report are:

For purposes of this complaint index reporting:

"Complaint Share" is the number of complaints received by the Office relative to the insurance industry expressed as a percentage.

"Complaint" is any written communication by an insured or named beneficiary expressing dissatisfaction with an insurance entity over which the Office has regulatory authority. This does not include complaints against an incorrect entity; complaints against companies providing administrative services for self-funded benefit plans; complaints for properly filed or approved rates; suspected fraudulent claim complaints; and complaints that are duplicative or frivolous. The Office extracts these numbers from the NAIC database; the NAIC receives the data from the Department of Financial Services, and standardizes the definition of complaints across 50 states.

"Market Share" is the company's direct written premium relative to the industry for a given line of insurance. The report expresses this ratio as a percentage.

"**Premiums**" are consideration paid to an insurer for the issuance and delivery of any binder or policy of insurance or annuity written directly to the consumer.

"Complaint Index" is a ratio derived by dividing a company's complaint share by its market share.

Ed. 4/11/2012 2